

THE USE OF INEXPENSIVE SALT MIXTURES FOR INLAND, INTENSIVE SHRIMP (*LITOPENAEUS VANNAMEI*) FARMING

Andrew J. Ray*, Jill C. Fisk, Leo J. Fleckenstein, and
Thomas W. Tierney

*Associate Professor, School of Aquaculture

Andrew.Ray@kysu.edu

Kentucky State University's Land Grant Program



Shrimp Production

- ▶ **#1 Seafood Item in Most Developed Countries**
- ▶ **Most Shrimp are Imported**
 - ▶ Trade Deficit
 - ▶ Food Safety (antibiotics/environmental toxins)
- ▶ **Produce Shrimp Inland, Near Markets**
 - ▶ Fresh, Never Frozen Possible
 - ▶ High Quality, Near Consumers
 - ▶ Healthy, Safe
 - ▶ Difficult to Acquire Otherwise
- ▶ **High Demand = Higher Sale Price**



Recirculating Aquaculture Systems (RAS)

- ▶ Closed systems
- ▶ Include Biofloc, Clear Water, & Hybrids of these
- ▶ Minimal H₂O exchanges
 - ▶ Salt and heat retention... marine animals inland!
- ▶ Environmentally safe... waste management
- ▶ High Biosecurity
- ▶ High animal densities
- ▶ Year-round production indoors → Tropical sp.
- ▶ Higher operational costs though...



Artificial Seawater Formulation

- ▶ Artificial Marine Sea Salt Mixes =
Great, But Expensive
- ▶ Salinity: RAS > 10 g/L
- ▶ How About Home-Made Salt
Formulations To Lower Costs?
 - ▶ Sure... But Be Careful!
- ▶ Recurring Problems: Deficiencies In Na, Mg,
K, & Ca Along With Ionic Balances
- ▶ Formulation of Low Cost Alternative Sea Salt
Mix Presents New Opportunities



Experimental Design

- ▶ Crystal Sea® Salt (CSS)
 - ▶ Standard, Complete Sea Salt Mix

- ▶ Least Cost Salt (LCS)

15 g/L Salt Solution @ 1m³

NaCl 11,310 (g)

MgSO₄ 1,830 (g)

MgCl₂ 855 (g)

CaCl₂ 376 (g)

KCl 240 (g)

NaHCO₃ 90 (g)

5 Treatments

- ▶ 1.) 100% CSS
- ▶ 2.) 75% CSS – 25% LCS
- ▶ 3.) 50% CSS – 50% LCS
- ▶ 4.) 75% LCS – 25% CSS
- ▶ 5.) 100% LCS
 - ▶ 20 – 1m³ tanks
 - ▶ 4 tanks per treatment
- ▶ Hybrid systems with external settling chambers and biofilter (MBBR)
- ▶ Salinity: 15 g/L for all tanks
- ▶ Density: 250 Shrimp/m³

Management

- ▶ **Duration: 84 days**
- ▶ **Initial Weight: 4.3 (g)**
- ▶ **Fed 3x Daily**
- ▶ **2x Daily: Temperature, DO, pH, & Salinity**
- ▶ **1x/Week: Ammonia (TAN), Nitrite (NO₂-N), and Turbidity (NTU)**
- ▶ **Final Data: Shrimp Production, Mineral Analysis**



Statistical Analysis

- ▶ **Shrimp Production**
 - ▶ One-way ANOVA
- ▶ **Mineral Analysis**
 - ▶ One-way ANOVA
- ▶ **Water Quality**
 - ▶ Repeated Measures ANOVA



Water Quality

Treatment

	100% CSS	75% CSS	50% CSS/LCS	75% LCS	100% LCS
Temperature °C	27.7 ± 0.1 (25.2-28.7)	27.7 ± 0.1 (25.1-28.6)	27.9 ± 0.1 (25.3-28.7)	27.7 ± 0.1 (25.2-28.6)	27.7 ± 0.1 (25.2-28.7)
Dissolved Oxygen (mg L ⁻¹)	6.2 ± 0.0 (5.4-7.0) ^{ab}	6.2 ± 0.0 (5.4-6.9) ^c	6.2 ± 0.0 (5.4-6.8) ^{bc}	6.2 ± 0.0 (5.5-6.8) ^a	6.2 ± 0.0 (5.5-6.9) ^{bc}
pH	7.9 ± 0.0 (7.7-8.3) ^a	7.9 ± 0.0 (7.7-8.3) ^b	7.9 ± 0.0 (7.7-8.3) ^b	7.9 ± 0.0 (7.7-8.3) ^b	7.9 ± 0.0 (7.7-8.3) ^b
Salinity (g L ⁻¹)	15.1 ± 0.0 (14.6-15.7)	15.2 ± 0.0 (14.5-15.7)	15.2 ± 0.0 (14.4-15.8)	15.2 ± 0.0 (14.3-15.7)	15.2 ± 0.0 (14.8-15.7)
Ammonia (mg TAN L ⁻¹)	0.2 ± 0.1 (0.1-1.5)	0.2 ± 0.1 (0.1-1.0)	0.3 ± 0.1 (0.1-1.4)	0.2 ± 0.1 (0.1-1.0)	0.3 ± 0.1 (0.1-1.2)
Nitrite (mg NO ₂ -N L ⁻¹)	1.2 ± 0.4 (0.4-3.9) ^{ab}	0.8 ± 0.1 (0.4-1.6) ^a	1.2 ± 0.3 (0.4-3.6) ^{ab}	0.9 ± 0.2 (0.4-2.0) ^{ab}	1.2 ± 0.2 (0.5-2.3) ^b
Turbidity (NTU)	32.1 ± 2.8 (18.7-48.8)	33.8 ± 3.2 (16.6-46.9)	30.1 ± 2.8 (15.0-40.7)	28.2 ± 2.2 (19.4-39.3)	32.6 ± 2.6 (19.4-42.44)

Minerals					
Treatment					
H ₂ O	100% CSS	75% CSS	50% CSS/LCS	75% LCS	100% LCS
Na	5361 ± 471	5150 ± 353	5320 ± 399	5207 ± 433	5572 ± 440
Ca	99 ± 9	101 ± 11	109 ± 10	121 ± 12	126 ± 14
SO ₄₋₂	1635 ± 88 ^a	1288 ± 41 ^b	1165 ± 27 ^{bc}	1163 ± 29 ^{bc}	974 ± 28 ^c
Mg	591 ± 51 ^a	520 ± 33 ^{ab}	477 ± 33 ^{ab}	430 ± 34 ^{ab}	411 ± 32 ^b
Sr	4.6 ± 0.4 ^a	4.0 ± 0.1 ^{ab}	3.8 ± 0.1 ^{ab}	3.6 ± 0.1 ^b	3.3 ± 0.3 ^b
Treatment					
Tissue	100% CSS	75% CSS	50% CSS/LCS	75% LCS	100% LCS
Na	26117 ± 1429	28671 ± 1575	27655 ± 1277	27572 ± 1133	26453 ± 437
Ca	57883 ± 6205	63467 ± 9730	69160 ± 3374	71384 ± 1394	64731 ± 771
P	47276 ± 391 ^{ab}	52034 ± 2230 ^{ab}	52672 ± 574 ^a	47683 ± 1333 ^{ab}	46697 ± 898 ^b
K	24970 ± 598 ^{ab}	26363 ± 793 ^a	25487 ± 928 ^{ab}	23919 ± 717 ^{ab}	22682 ± 603 ^b

Shrimp Production

	Treatment				
	100% CSS	75% CSS	50% CSS/LCS	75% LCS	100% LCS
Average Weight (g)	22.9 ± 0.8	22.2 ± 0.5	22.4 ± 0.2	22.5 ± 0.6	22.5 ± 0.4
Growth rate (%)	1.6 ± 0.1	1.5 ± 0.0	1.5 ± 0.0	1.5 ± 0.1	1.5 ± 0.0
FCR	1.8 ± 0.1	1.7 ± 0.1	1.8 ± 0.1	1.6 ± 0.1	2.1 ± 0.2
Kg/m ³	3.8 ± 0.2	3.9 ± 0.2	3.8 ± 0.3	4.0 ± 0.2	3.2 ± 0.3
Survival (%)	67.2 ± 3.8	70.3 ± 3.9	68.3 ± 5.2	73.1 ± 4.2	57.2 ± 6.2

- No significant differences detected

Salt Cost per Ingredient			Salt Cost per Formulation	
Items	\$USD per 1m ⁻³	\$USD per/Kg	Treatment	\$USD per 1m ⁻³
NaCl (22.6 Kg)	\$5.37	\$0.42	100% CSS	\$25.08
MgSO ₄ (22.6 Kg)	\$1.96	\$0.95	75% CSS	\$21.02
MgCl ₂ (25 Kg)	\$0.67	\$0.70	50% CSS/LCS	\$16.96
CaCl ₂ (22.6 Kg)	\$0.60	\$0.77	75% LCS	\$12.89
KCl (25 Kg)	\$0.23	\$0.86	100% LCS	\$8.83
NaHCO ₃ (22.6 Kg)	\$0.01	\$0.73		

➤ 100% CSS is 2.8x more expensive than LCS

Cost of Salt per Kg of Shrimp

Treatment	\$USD
100% CSS	\$6.66 ^a
75% CSS	\$5.50 ^a
50% CSS/LCS	\$4.57 ^b
75% LCS	\$3.20 ^c
100% LCS	\$2.87 ^c



- 100% LCS & 75% LCS Significantly Less Cost/kg Than the Others
- 100% CSS is 2.3x More Expensive (per Kg of Shrimp) Than 100% LCS!

Follow Up Study... Low levels of CSS

▶ Treatments

- ▶ 100% LCS
- ▶ 97.5%/2.5% LCS/CSS
- ▶ 95%/5% LCS/CSS
- ▶ 90%/10% LCS/CSS
- ▶ 80%/20% LCS/CSS
- ▶ 75%/25% LCS/CSS

▶ Similar Design

▶ Same Systems/ Management

▶ Same Data Analysis

▶ Very Similar Results!

▶ No Significant Differences in Shrimp Production

Conclusions

- ▶ **No Effect (or Very Little) on Water Quality**
 - ▶ Some inconsistent differences in DO, pH, and $\text{NO}_2\text{-N}$
- ▶ **Some Differences in Mineral levels**
 - ▶ $\text{H}_2\text{O} \rightarrow \text{SO}_4, \text{Mg}, \& \text{Sr}$
 - ▶ Shrimp Tissue $\rightarrow \text{P} \& \text{K}$
- ▶ **No Significant Differences in Shrimp Production**
- ▶ **Cost of Salt per Kg Shrimp < Half the Cost**



Future Investigations

- ▶ **Determine if There are Effects of Salt Concentration (salinity levels)**
- ▶ **Long-Term Water Use Effects**
- ▶ **Effects of System Type**
- ▶ **Effects on Overall Production Economics**



Thank You!

- ▶ **Kentucky State University School of Aquaculture**
- ▶ **Funding: USDA-NIFA**
 - ▶ **Agriculture and Food Research Initiative**
- ▶ **KSU Center for Sustainable Shrimp Aquaculture Production**

